

McNaughton House
416 East Second House
Madison
Jefferson County
Indiana

HABS No. IND-89

HABS
IND,
39-MAD,
15-

PHOTOGRAPHS

WRITTEN HISTORICAL AND DESCRIPTIVE DATA

Historic American Buildings Survey
Office of Archeology and Historic Preservation
National Park Service
Department of the Interior
Washington, D.C. 20243

HISTORIC AMERICAN BUILDINGS SURVEY

HAB-89
IND.
39-MAD.
15-
HABS No. IND-89

McNAUGHTON HOUSE

Location: 416 East Second Street (south side of street),
Madison, Jefferson County, Indiana.

USGS Madison East Quadrangle; Universal Transverse
Mercator Coordinates: 16.641500.4288540.

Present Owner: Third Street Investments Company.

Present Occupant: Renters.

Present Use: Residence, rental property.

Statement of
Significance: The McNaughton house is representative of Madison's
local residential vernacular during the mid-nineteenth
century. This particular house type is laid out on an
L-shaped plan and is characterized by a three-bay
front facade and a two-story gallery wing which faces
a side garden. Allen McNaughton was a founder in
establishing Madison as a leader in the national
pork-packing industry.

PART I. HISTORICAL INFORMATION

A. Physical History:

1. Date of erection: 1851-52. The tax records for the City
of Madison show a marked increase in the assessed value of
the property from \$2500 in 1851, to a value of \$5600 in 1852.
This increase may indicate that a building was erected upon
the property during the summer of 1851 and completed by the
spring of 1852.
2. Original and subsequent owners: The property upon which the
structure stands is part of Lot 98 in Old Town, Madison,
Indiana. References to the following chain of title are in
the Office of the Recorder of Deeds, Jefferson County Court-
house, Madison, Indiana.

1850 Deed, May 20, 1850, recorded May 24, 1850, in Book 6,
page 212. Jessie and Rebecca M. Whitehead sold the
title to the property to Allen S. McNaughton. The
property was described as follows: "Beginning thirty-
three feet east of the northwest corner of Lot 98, thence
east twenty-four feet on the south line of (East)
Second Street . . . for consideration of \$480."

- 1852 Deed, January 2, 1852, recorded November 22, 1852 in Book 8, page 507. Thomas Hewson, Jr. sold the title to the property to Allen S. McNaughton. The property was described as follows: "Beginning thirty feet east of the northwest corner of Lot 98, thence east three feet on the line of (East) Second Street . . . for consideration of \$200." (The above two deeds constitute the building lot upon which the McNaughton house stands.)
- 1856 Deed, December 1, 1856, recorded December 13, 1856 in Book 13, page 428-29. Allen S. and Elizabeth McNaughton sold the property to Josiah S. Weher. The property was described as beginning at a point thirty feet east of the northwest corner of Lot 98, thence east twenty-seven feet . . . which is a brick house occupied by Ezra Butler.
- 1858 Deed, February 15, 1858, recorded March 13, 1858 in Book 15, page 134. Josiah S. Weyer sold the property to William H. Fitch. The property was described as the twenty-seven feet on the south side of East Second Street for consideration of \$2000.
- 1860 Deed, April 11, 1860, recorded in Book 17, page 561. Thomas and M. Kate Hewson sold the property to William H. Fitch. The property began at the northwest corner of Lot 98, thence east thirty feet on the south line of East Second Street, for consideration of \$1160.
- 1862 Deed, December 19, 1862, recorded February 21, 1863 in Book 21, page 22. William H. and Theresa Fitch sold the property to J.J. Craig. The property was described as "beginning at the northwest corner of Lot 98, thence east fifty-seven feet on the south line of East Second Street, thence south . . . through the partition wall between the tenement occupied by the Grantors and the tenement occupied by B.F. Mullen," for consideration of \$500.
- 1884 Deed, November 22, 1884, recorded November 24, 1884 in Book 48, page 514. John and Catherine Craig, and Henry Cragin, survivors of J.J. Craig, sold the property to J.B. Ross for \$40,000.
- 1901 Deed, September 13, 1901, recorded September 17, 1901 in Book 71, page 321. J.B. and Frances Ross sold the property to Lavina C. Barker.

- 1905 Deed, November 4, 1905, recorded November 13, 1905 in Book 77, page 507. Lavina C. and Dell Barker sold the property to William Hill.
- 1922 Deed, February 21, 1922, recorded February 22, 1922 in Book 92, page 215. William Hill sold the property to Robert D. and Tillie Kendall.
- 1931 Deed, February 6, 1951, recorded in Book 98, page 424. Robert D. and Tillie Kendall sold the property to Pearl E. Kennedy.
- 1940 Deed, October 1, 1940, recorded November 23, 1940 in Book 104, page 539. Pearl E. and Robert O. Kennedy sold the property to Alma M. Beeler.
- 1941 Deed, November 21, 1941, recorded in Book 106, page 103. Alma M. and John S. Beeler sold the property to Daniel Schollcraft.
- 1944 Deed, October 13, 1944, recorded October 21, 1944 in Book 109, page 253. Daniel B. and Mary B. Schollcraft sold the property to Raymond and Nellie A. Bovand.
- 1946 Deed, June 15, 1946, recorded in Book 111, page 498. Raymond and Nellie A. Bovand sold the property to Bertram J. Kincaid.
- 1952 Deed, October 31, 1952, recorded in Book 119, page 468. Bertram J. and Claudie Kincaid sold the property to Walter C. and Edith Vinup.
- 1967 Deed, June 26, 1967, recorded June 30, 1967 in Book 143, page 102. The First National Bank of Madison, acting as executor for Walter C. Vinup, sold the property to Sidney E. and Margie H. Cofield.
- 1971 Deed, July 9, 1971, recorded July 9, 1971 in Book 155, page 66. Sidney E. and Margie H. Cofield sold the property to A.J. Cutone.
- 1973 Deed, September 11, 1973, recorded in Book 157, page 1112. A.J. and Mary A. Cutone sold the property to J.L. Webster.
- 1978 Deed, March 9, 1978, recorded in Book 162, page 264. J.L. and Betty Webster sold the property to the Third Street Investments Company.
3. Original plan and construction: The McNaughton house is laid out on an L-shaped plan. It is two stories and measures

approximately thirty feet (north front elevation) by one-hundred thirty feet. The three-bay facade faces north on Second Street with the gable ridge running parallel to the street, the rear wing is perpendicular to Second Street. This house type has one long wall built along the property line. The McNaughton house's east elevation (one-hundred thirty feet deep) has no openings and is the party wall to the adjacent property.

The front facade is executed in a modified urban variation of the Greek Revival style - a mode which dominates Madison's mid-nineteenth century residential architecture. The main entrance is at the east end of the facade and is detailed with a classical entablature. The two-over-two paneled door is recessed and framed by side and transom lights. Squared Tuscan pilasters flank the doorway. Windows of the north elevation are full-length four-over-four light double-hung sash and topped by pedimented stone lintels. The sheet-iron cornice at the roof line is classical in design, appearing to be of a later date than the house. Small brackets with fleur-de-lis detailing divide the denticulated cornice at regular intervals. The far eastern end of the cornice features a single grand bracket, also detailed with a fleur-de-lis pattern. The front elevation is dominated by a wrought-iron balcony at the second floor, supported by scrolled brackets. The iron is molded in a lyre and diamond pattern with a small S-scroll border at its top. It is possible that a similar balcony was once located at the first level and subsequently removed.

The rear wing has a two-story, three-bayed porch on the west elevation, facing the garden. To the south of the porch is a later two-story section and an added one-story kitchen wing. A large chimney rises from the kitchen's eastern wall, near the two-story wing.

The interior is laid out on a side-hall plan with a double parlor on the first floor of the main section. Two second-floor rooms correspond to those on the first level. At the end of the main stair hall, a door connects the main section with the rear wing. The wing is organized by a sequence of rooms, one opening into the other. Each of these rooms has a fireplace built into the party wall; two windows are on the opposite wall which faces the garden or side porch. There are two or three bedrooms on the wing's second floor.

The lot that the house stands upon is bordered on the west and south by an alley, and shares a partition wall with a smaller house on its eastern wall, which was built a few years after the completion of the McNaughton house. An elaborate cast-iron fence borders the Second Street front. The fence appears to be the work of the Cobb and Stribling Foundry of Madison. Mounted on a running limestone base the fence's end posts are ornamented with a lotus leaf motif on the shaft and capped by a pineapple finial.

4. Alterations and additions: The original fabric and appearance of the McNaughton house remain virtually intact. The sheet-metal cornice on the front facade is most likely a later addition, probably added ca. 1870. Two carriage lights have been added to the pilasters flanking the main entrance. The rear wing has undergone the most changes: a two-story section was added to the south side at the rear which included a one-story kitchen section. A first-floor balcony, similar in design to the one on the second level of the front facade, may have existed and subsequently been removed.

B. Historical Events and Persons Connected with the Structure:

Allen S. McNaughton was born in Virginia in 1815, and had moved to Madison by 1837. At this time he joined with the two partners of White, Cunningham, & McNaughton, thereby founding Madison's early pork-packing industry. The success of his early association with White and Cunningham established McNaughton's own personal fortune. It was also the beginning of a nation-wide industry, of which Madison became a leading producer. The city's dominance in this industry continued throughout the nineteenth century and into the first half of the twentieth.

In 1851 McNaughton dissolved his association with White and Cunningham due to ill health, and began a grocery business on Mulberry Street. Between 1851 and 1852 he resided at 416 East Second Street, and built at least three other residences along this block before 1856. In 1852, he built a substantial residence on the hilltop above Madison on Michigan Road, retaining 416 East Second as a rental property. In July 1856, the Madison "Daily Courier" noted that "A.S. McNaughton is selling out because of ill health," and offers "the brick building of 10 rooms occupied by E.R. Butler." McNaughton's health continued to decline and he died on December 3, 1856 at age forty-one, leaving an estate of over \$20,000.

C. Bibliography:

1. Primary and unpublished sources:

Jefferson County Deed Records, Office of the Recorder,
Jefferson County Courthouse, Madison, Indiana.

Tax Records and Assessments of the City of Madison,
1837-1855. Madison City Hall, Madison, Indiana.

2. Secondary and published sources:

Madison "Daily Courier," December 18, 1850; December 20,
1851; August 19, 1852; December 13, 1852; July 2, 1856;
August 7, 1856; December 3, 1856.

United States Census of 1850. Jefferson County, Madison,
Indiana.

Prepared by Philip Dole
Team Historian
Historic American
Buildings Survey
Summer 1971

John Hopkins
Team Historian
Historic American
Buildings Survey
Summer 1978

PART II. PROJECT INFORMATION

This project was undertaken by the Historic American Buildings Survey in cooperation with the Historic Landmarks Foundation of Indiana and Historic Madison. The structure was recorded in the summer of 1971 under the direction of James C. Massey, then the Chief of HABS, and Melvin M. Rotsch (Texas A & M University), with student assistant architects John G. Albers (University of Florida), Bruce E. Lynch (Washington University), H.T. Moriarity (University of Texas), John M. Szubski (Princeton University), and architectural historian Philip Dole (University of Oregon), at the HABS Field Office in Madison, Indiana. The data was expanded by John Hopkins in August 1978, and edited in the HABS Washington office by staff historian Jan E. Cigliano in January 1979. Photographs were taken by staff photographer Jack E. Boucher in September 1971.